

# **PLANNING REVIEW COMMITTEE**

**Tuesday 26 June 2012**

**COUNCILLORS PRESENT:** Councillors Bance (Chair), Fooks (Vice-Chair), Baxter, Lygo, McManners, Rowley, Wolff, Coulter and Gotch.

**OFFICERS PRESENT:** Mathew Metcalfe (Democratic and Electoral Services), Michael Morgan (Law and Governance) and Nick Worlledge (City Development)

## **1. ELECTION OF CHAIR FOR COUNCIL YEAR 2012/2013**

The Committee agreed to elect Councillor Antonia Bance as Chair for the Council Year 2012/13.

## **2. ELECTION OF VICE-CHAIR FOR COUNCIL YEAR 2012/2013**

The Committee agreed to elect Councillor Jean Fooks as Vice-Chair for the Council Year 2012/13.

## **3. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Alan Armitage (Councillor Mike Gotch attended as a substitute) and Ed Turner (Councillor Van Coulter attended as a substitute).

## **4. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

No declarations of interest were declared.

## **5. PLANNING APPLICATIONS 12/00495/FUL AND 12/00460/LBC - MAGDALEN COLLEGE**

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended) which detailed two applications as follows:

- (1) Extension to existing library to provide book storage, reading rooms, staff accommodation, seminar rooms, landscaping to quadrangle and provision of level access and bicycle storage facilities;
- (2) External and internal alterations and extension to library involving the removal of inserted floor and staircase, insertion of new staircase, lift to provide book storage, reading rooms, staff accommodation and seminar space.

The application was considered by the West Area Planning Committee at its meeting on 30<sup>th</sup> May 2012, where it agreed not to grant planning permission for the following reasons:

- (1) *To refuse planning consent for application 12/00459/FUL for the following reasons:-*
- (a) *The proposal would form an inappropriate visual relationship with the existing Grade II\* listed New Library building and the surrounding development that lies within the Central City and University Conservation Area. The proposals are therefore considered to be contrary to policies HE3, HE7 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016, and policy CS18 of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026.*
  - (b) *The construction of the plinth/terrace would cause unacceptable harm by its visual impact on the setting and special architectural and historical interest of the Grade II\* listed New Library building that is not outweighed by the public benefit of development. The proposals are therefore considered to be contrary to policies HE3, HE7 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016, and policy CS18 of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026.*
- (2) *To refuse planning consent for application 12/00460/LBC for the following reasons:-*
- (a) *The proposal would form an inappropriate visual relationship with the existing Grade II\* listed New Library building and the surrounding development that lies within the Central City and University Conservation Area. The proposals for listed building consent are therefore contrary to the advice in the National Planning Policy Framework 2012.*
  - (b) *The construction of the plinth/terrace would cause unacceptable harm by its visual impact on the setting and special architectural and historical interest of the Grade II\* listed New Library building that is not outweighed by the public benefit of development.. The proposals for listed building consent are therefore contrary to the advice in the National Planning Policy Framework 2012.*

Following the West Area Planning Committee meeting, the applications were subsequently called-in by Councillor Mary Clarkson, Colin Cook, Van Coulter, James Fry, Patricia Kennedy, Shah Jahan Kahn, Joe McManners, Susanna Pressel, Bob Price, Mike Rowley, Gill Sanders, Scott Seamons, John Tanner and Ed Turner as they felt that the reasons for refusal were not strong with a risk of losing on appeal.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, Charles Young, Claire Wright and Julian Mumby spoke in favour of the applications. No requests to speak against the applications were received.

The Committee considered all submissions, both written and oral and agreed:

- (a) With regard to application 12/00459/FUL, to grant planning permission subject to the 13 conditions as laid out in the Planning Officers report submitted to the West Area Planning Committee on 30<sup>th</sup> May 2012.;

- (b) With regard to application 12/00460/LBC to grant Listed Building Consent, subject to the 13 conditions as laid out in the Planning Officers report submitted to the West Area Planning Committee on 30<sup>th</sup> May 2012.

## **6. MINUTES**

The Committee agreed to approve the minutes (previously circulated, now appended) of the meetings held on 15<sup>th</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2011.

## **7. DATES OF MEETINGS**

The Committee agreed to note that it would meet (subject to their being business to transact) at 6.00pm in the Town Hall on the following dates:

Wednesday 25<sup>th</sup> August 2012  
Wednesday 29<sup>th</sup> August 2012  
Tuesday 25<sup>th</sup> September 2012  
Wednesday 31<sup>st</sup> October 2012  
Wednesday 28<sup>th</sup> November 2012  
Wednesday 19<sup>th</sup> December 2012  
Wednesday 30<sup>th</sup> January 2013  
Wednesday 27<sup>th</sup> February 2013  
Wednesday 27<sup>th</sup> March 2013  
Wednesday 24<sup>th</sup> April 2013

**The meeting started at 6.00 pm and ended at 7.20 pm**